

Contents

ANALYZING THE LANDSCAPE OF NARRATIVES ABOUT FARMING ANIMALS: ADVOCATES, MEDIA, AND INDUSTRY	- 3 -
Methods	- 3 -
Sample	- 3 -
Analysis	- 4 -
Key Recommendations	- 5 -
Findings	- 6 -
What's the issue?	- 6 -
Animals	- 10 -
Animal Advocates	- 13 -
Animal Industry	- 14 -
Government	- 16 -
Public Health	- 16 -
Environment	- 17 -
Consumers' Responsibility	- 19 -
Conclusion	- 22 -



Analyzing the Landscape of Narratives about Farming Animals: Advocates, Media, and Industry

Prepared for Pax Fauna by Eva Hamer

This is the third in a series of five reports on a multi-phase messaging study for animal advocates. The full series is summarized at paxfauna.org/reports

This report aims to provide an overview of the narratives currently in play by the industry, advocates themselves, and the media. By noticing which narratives are and aren't being echoed by the media, we examine implications for advocates and inform the later phases of our messaging research.

Methods

Sample

In conducting a review of materials recently disseminated by advocacy groups, we included website content from The Humane League (THL), Mercy for Animals (MFA), and Farm Sanctuary, as well as press releases from Direct Action Everywhere (DxE) and People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals (PETA) regarding animals used for food, excluding press releases regarding animals used for other purposes such as entertainment and testing. Also included in this review were transcripts of popular videos from prominent advocates Earthling Ed, James Aspey, and Vegan Evan. The prominent individual advocates are considered one group for the purpose of analysis, given the cohesive strategy they collectively represent- convincing individuals to go vegan.

While food is often discussed in the materials we reviewed, we intentionally excluded advocates known primarily for their discussion of food and health, regardless of their notoriety. We also exclude those whose primary audience consists of animal advocates or vegans, favoring instead materials directed toward the public at large.

In our review of industry narratives, we conducted Google Searches of *Superbowl ad meat*, *TV commercial meat*, *cheese ads*, *meat ads*, and *milk ads*. We also reviewed the ads



section of the website for Center for Consumer Freedom, the Animal Agriculture Alliance, the National Institute for Animal Agriculture, Farm Babe, and Meatingplace. We also examined the websites for animal product US Checkoff Programs, which are government-run advertising programs responsible for campaigns such as *Got Milk?* and *Beef, It's What's For Dinner*. They're funded by mandatory fees paid by industry and thus are strictly regulated: US checkoff programs can use government funding to advocate *for* their product but not *against* any other. Checkoff programs we included were the American Egg Board, the American Lamb Board, the National Dairy Promotion and Research Council, and the National Pork Board.

To review media articles we made Google News searches using these keywords: *animals food, animal agriculture, animal cruelty farming, farm animals, factory farming, aquaculture cruelty, animal rights, and animal rights protest*, and selected articles with titles and content discussing the ethical concerns of farming animals. All of the relevant articles published by news outlets on the first three pages of Google results were included in the analysis. Pro-advocate outlets, such as VegNews, and pro-industry outlets, such as *Agweek*, were excluded. Media Outlets were not excluded for political bias or small readership. We limited the media analysis to articles published in 2022.

Google searches for the media analysis took place between Oct 31 and Nov 2, 2022. In October 2022, several newsworthy events occurred related to animals used for food: a trial and acquittal of animal rights activists in Utah, a sentencing of animal rights activists in Canada, and the arguing of California's Proposition 12, landmark animal rights legislation, in front of the US Supreme Court. This may have created more positive media dialogue than we may have observed had we conducted the searches at a different time.

References for each section are listed separately and indicated in-text by an endnote preceded with an abbreviation of the reference list from which it came- Adv. for Advocate, Ind. for Industry, and Med. for Media.

Analysis

We used inductive thematic analysis to separately analyze each section, using the qualitative analysis software Taguette, which allows for creating tags to identify themes. Inductive thematic analysis is a process of analyzing qualitative data that identifies themes that are named as they emerge in the data. After gathering the samples and uploading them to Taguette, we identified themes and tagged instances in each sample while writing subject memos. This allowed us to examine the data by theme to understand how each idea presented throughout the sample.



Key Recommendations

After examining the interaction between ideas in advocate, industry, and media materials, we present several takeaways to help advocates succeed. Each theme is discussed in further detail later in the report.

It seems that the media is listening to advocates. Their efforts to get the issue on the table are fruitful and should be continued through legal cases, ballot measures, rescue, and investigation.

The media seems willing to engage with our strongest frames, and care should be taken to create situations and stories that emphasize them. The media accept that animal farming is a problem that requires a solution, but the solutions they are currently presenting are not the ones advocates would hope to see. That said, overall the media is receptive to our message.

Ask for What We Want

Advocates can push harder when speaking to the media. We have a real chance to win them over to our genuine goal: adopting a narrative that violence against animals is a sufficient reason to leave animal farming behind completely. We advise advocates to tell a story of society *shifting away from using animals for food, completely*, in the light of any specific policy goals they're working on.

Use animals' names

Whenever it is natural to do so, name individual animals. This invites media and others to do the same, which allows a semantic upgrade for animals from property to person and provides an identifiable victim with whom to feel empathy.

Cruelty is Widespread

Consider the ramifications of emphasizing individual instances of cruelty, which may imply that unspeakable cruelty is *not* the norm in the industry. Instead, emphasize the ubiquity of animal cruelty as norms throughout the animal industries.

Voters, not Consumers

De-emphasize the consumer frame to tell a story of voters and citizens, not consumers. Speak of change that society is undergoing together, shared values upheld by particular policies, and avoid making consumerist recommendations, even implied.



Their activism is the slow, grinding work of changing cultural norms — to shift the value of a farmed animal from commercial to intrinsic.^{Med. 57}

Findings

What's the issue?

Getting the issue on the table

An “all press is good press” strategy suggests that some advocates are confident that when members of the public engage with their arguments, they’ll surely be won over. They also understand that their audience desperately does not want to hear from them. In the words of a seven-year-old Vegan Evan, “Most people don't think about what they're doing because they don't want to think about someone dying.”^{Adv. 6}

The media sources we reviewed suggest this belief is correct: the news articles we examined were overwhelmingly positive and usually relayed advocate messages more strongly than industry ones. If bad press exists, the movement isn't its cause. Significant exceptions to this observation demonstrate that the task ahead of us, in the face of effective industry messages picked up by the media, is greater than simply getting the issue on the table. It will instead require using stronger messages that can overcome ineffective default frames and strong industry messages currently in use by the public and the media.

Advocates' issue

The solutions or “asks” offered by the advocates vary widely, as do their presentations of the issue. Moreover, the issue is often reduced to a list of terms that may not have much relevance to the reader, such as this quote from DxE, found within a press release that otherwise describes a protest: “*It's time to shut down factory farms and slaughterhouses and create a future that prioritizes compassion, public health and the environment.*”^{Adv. 12}

On the bright side, the media does identify that animal agriculture has far-reaching impacts, which devastate habitats, pose a threat to human health, and exploit workers, among other things. This closely mimics how advocates discuss the laundry list of problems with animal agriculture, affecting **animals**, the **environment**, and **public health**.

There are lots of reasons why, on paper, meat grown in bioreactors is a brilliant idea. For a start, we'd be able to cut down on intensive animal farming, which can be brutal and inhumane. Rearing animals in cramped



conditions can create the perfect conditions for diseases to spread, and even pass to humans.^{Med. 22}

Even when a story clearly relates primarily to one problem with animal agriculture, the media is willing to mention others. In the following instances of media quoting advocates in pieces about the Supreme Court argument on California's Proposition 12, legislation that protects animal welfare leads to a discussion of industry harms to human health.

"The Court has repeatedly affirmed the states' rights to enact laws protecting animals, public health and safety, and the pork industry should focus on eliminating cruel caging of animals rather than attacking popular, voter-passed animal cruelty laws."^{Med. 14}

"In addition to the extreme cruelty, it's a human health problem," Block said. "When you confine animals in these terrible conditions, it is a breeding ground for viruses."^{Med. 12}

What's more, according to the media, is that we're basically winning. Both advocates and industry are quoted to make this point.

"They just let a guy who walked into a factory farm and took two piglets out without the consent of Smithfield walk out of the courtroom free," Hsiung, who co-founded DxE in 2013, told reporters outside the courthouse in St. George, Utah. "If it can happen in southern Utah, it can happen anywhere."^{Med. 54}

Ng said such exposés have "forced" the global aquaculture industry to counter any "false narratives" and so create better environmental outcomes and more humane treatment of farmed aquatic animals, which he said is a positive outcome for the industry as a whole.^{Med. 8}

Policy wins, both in the corporate and government spheres, are newsworthy.

*Long-distance transport of live animals has come into the spotlight after an EU Parliament committee called on member states and the Commission at the start of the year to **step up their efforts** in ensuring greater respect for animal welfare.*^{Med. 10}

Since 2017, when Galvani started out as the sole employee, the organization has garnered over 60 commitments from large food companies operating in these regions to source cage-free eggs, or pork from pigs that weren't confined in small crates. Some of those include big supermarket chains, like



Cencosud in Latin America, Central Retail Food Group in Thailand, and Ismaya, a restaurant operator in Indonesia. ^{Med. 56}

Industry's issue

Individual Farmers

In industry promotional materials, **supporting farmers** is presented as, in itself, a moral good.

When you choose American Lamb, you support the nation's shepherds and their families and help to sustain working farmland and farm communities. ^{Ind. 6}

Community

The farmers' and farms' contribution to and membership in their **communities** is emphasized. Every farmer is both a consumer and a producer, so it is in their interests to do everything by the book.

The beef that farmers and ranchers raise is the same beef they feed their own families, so it's no surprise that they want the best care for their livestock to ensure everyone has wholesome, safe, nutritious beef. ^{Ind. 2}

Try to spend your money in your own community by supporting farmers that employ these practices as this also strengthens regional economies. ^{Ind. 15}

Cost

Food cost is invoked by the industry as a perk of animal products and as a risk associated with letting their adversaries win.

Chicken is the affordable cornerstone to a nutritious meal. ^{Ind. 4}

While these ideas are not unheard of in media reports, they didn't appear in our analysis, perhaps because of a high volume of advocate-prompted newsworthy stories in October 2022.

Economy

Industry promotional messages also present the industry as necessary by emphasizing the **economic activity** it's responsible for, a message more often repeated by the media.

One of the three most important economic sectors, Colorado's agricultural sector accounts for approximately \$47 billion of economic activity. In real numbers, 170,000 jobs in Colorado related to agribusiness and tens of thousands of these jobs will be lost if this measure passes. ^{Ind. 8}



"Our plan was to keep farmers farming," Hoggard said. Instead, he said farmers would be selling their farms "so fast you won't even hear the dogs barking on the back of the ute (pickup truck) as they drive off."^{Med. 44}

Much of the agriculture industry rebukes Proposition 12, as many farming facilities don't meet its standards. To date, about 65,000 farmers raise 125 million pigs annually, boasting a \$26 million in gross sales.^{Med. 4}

Even a piece that is generally friendly to advocates invokes economic activity to illustrate the difficulty advocate interests face.

On Saturday, a jury acquitted two of the activists on the charges, a somewhat unexpected verdict in a part of rural Utah whose economy is largely tied to the fortunes of agricultural giants like Smithfield.^{Med. 27}

Supporting a Better Way

A frame sometimes reported by the media is to present a **better way** of producing animals as the solution. This takes the form of lionizing small or organic farms, newfangled sustainable farming methods, or farmers' own efforts to improve their practices.

Food production is one of the major drivers of the climate crisis, but new practices in agriculture offer important solutions. The bottom line is that the way that we move forward with producing food will have everything do with our success in addressing the climate crisis.^{Med. 40}

The Jovaag Family Farm is part of the Niman Ranch network of family farmers who specialize in certified "humanely-raised" pigs and other animals. They abandoned gestation stalls, or crates, years ago and now give pregnant sows more than 60-square-feet each, piles of comfortable hay and fresh air and sunlight.^{Med. 12}

Fake Food

Characterization of plant-based meat as **fake**, artificial, and created in a lab is repeated often. We didn't find this echoed by the media.

Lab-grown meat, in particular, is not a good cultural fit for Nebraska. Think about going to Misty's Steakhouse in Lincoln: "I'll have the synthetic medium-rare steak with that special A1 CO2 sauce, but with a little less red dye this time, thanks."^{Ind. 7}



Animals

This section looks at how different actors talk about animals themselves.

A rat is a pig is a dog is a boy: Advocates on animals

In an attempt to garner empathy from the audience for animals used for food, all five advocate groups we examined invoked similarities between these animals and humans or animals who are more readily offered empathy- generally cats and dogs. Animals' abilities are given ample real estate, such as in Mercy for Animals blog post reporting on **Cuttlefish Passing the Marshmallow Test**.^{Adv. 7} Animals' friendly or loving relationships with humans, other animals, and their family members are often cited briefly and sometimes explored in depth, as exemplified by The Humane League's article '**Five animals who escaped from slaughter against all odds**'.^{Adv. 23}

In line with these messages, we found media reports referring to rescued piglets by name, affirming the sentience of fishes, and describing animals' unique personalities.

But Ganzert told a happier story about a chicken named Rose and a horse named Princess.^{Med. 48}

"Despite overwhelming scientific evidence that fish are sentient, conscious, capable of pain, suffering and logical thought," the state does not provide proper oversight of how fish are raised and treated in aquaculture facilities, according to a 32-page petition filed Aug. 1 by the groups, only two of which are Maine-based.^{Med. 8}

The 1,400-pound male bison is the undisputed patriarch of a small northern Maine bison herd and he loves few things more than noshing on fall gourds.^{Med. 5}

The individual advocates emphasize the tradeoff between an animal's life and the momentary pleasure of a meal. The speech analyzed by Earthling Ed even featured a lengthy introduction in which Ed speaks of how much he used to enjoy consuming animals, to drive the point later that animals don't deserve to die for our taste buds.^{Adv. 21}

As obvious as this problem is, the media never touched it, with the exception of an exceptionally pro-animal Vox article summing up the question in its title, "What is an animal's life worth?"^{Med. 57}



Veterinarians: Industry on Animals

Industry frames usually emphasize some other part of the picture, guiding the public to think of the food supply instead. But when animals are discussed, farmers are characterized as caring experts. They work closely with **veterinarians** whose ethical stances are beyond reproach.

Veterinarians have to be part of the work to sustain and steward the natural resources that make farming—and life on this planet—possible.^{Med. 40}

Criminal Animal Abuse: Advocates on cruelty

DxE and PETA both named animal abuse as criminal and discussed reporting animal abuse to authorities, though in different ways. DxE, in many press releases, calls for the prosecution of corporate actors for routine violence against animals, sometimes citing legal opinions and contacting law enforcement.

“In the face of a pandemic, it’s unconscionable that our government would prosecute a nonviolent activist exposing the truth about corporate misconduct and the presence of dangerous pathogens,” said Bonnie Klapper, a former federal prosecutor who represents DxE. “Our legal system should be pursuing the animal abuser -- Smithfield -- and not the animal rescuer.”^{Adv.18}

DxE alleges the slaughter process depicted amounts to criminal animal cruelty, and it filed a complaint with local and state officials Tuesday. As of Saturday, they had not received any response.^{Adv. 15}

In the materials we reviewed, PETA reserves these solely for individual instances of abuse and often calls for the workers themselves to be prosecuted.

PETA ... sent a letter today to Bristol County District Attorney Thomas M. Quinn III calling on him to review the matter and, as appropriate, file criminal cruelty-to-animals charges against the facility and the worker(s) responsible for shooting a cow in the head four times.^{Adv. 29}

“Bad Actors” Backfire: Industry on Welfare

Focusing the blame on individual bad actors is a strong industry frame found in the media—when cruelty is present, that’s an anomaly whose solution is to fire or correct the bad actor and let the industry go on functioning as normal. Quotes from industry representatives in the media relied on this idea to frame cruelty as the exception and not the rule.



In response to footage filmed by Open Cages at Cranswick chicken factory, which showed birds struggling to support their own weight, Morrisons released a statement. They told ITV they had launched a "full investigation" and that they "care[d] deeply about animal welfare."^{Med. 37}

In response, Cooke Aquaculture CEO Glenn Cooke released a statement... "I am disappointed and deeply saddened by what I saw today," Cooke said in the Oct. 7, 2019 statement. "As a family company, we place animal welfare high in our operating standards and endeavor to raise our animals with optimal care and consideration of best practice."^{Med. 8}

Calm and Comfortable: Industry on the Welfare Status Quo

In discussions of welfare, industry emphasizes animals' freedom to move around barns and comfort and calmness while in transit and slaughtered. Farmers care for their animals so much that cruelty is unthinkable. An important principle relied on by the industry is that stressed animals are less productive, which means that farmers don't have an economic incentive to create cruel conditions.

"Any deviation from our high standards for animal care is counterproductive to this mission and would never be tolerated."^{Med. 2}

"We believe that that creates a healthier animal, and a healthier animal equates to healthier product to eat."^{Med. 12}

Media reports detailing cruelty often appeared in our analysis, sometimes quite graphically.^{Med. 2, 6, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 18, 19, 22, 23, 27, 28, 29, 30, 32, 33, 37, 39, 46, 48, 49, 54, 56, 57, 62} The following representative quote is shared alone to illustrate the extent of graphic imagery a highly respected outlet, the New York Times, published.

*Although Hsiung and Picklesimer "documented dead and dying piglets in piles of feces and blood and claim the two piglets they removed were injured, sick, and starving," DxE noted, Wilcox **ruled** in February that "video of the rescue—and any evidence of the condition of the animals—is barred because it might arouse 'horror' in the jury."^{Med. 27}*

In industry materials, humane meat is billed as something you can feel better about buying, and discussed to support certification programs that most producers use and to imply high welfare standards across the industry.



*Dairy farmers—with small or large farms—use best management practices as outlined in the **National Dairy Farmers Assuring Responsible Management (FARM) Animal Care Program** to ensure their cows are well-cared for by providing them with a nutritious diet, plenty of water and well-ventilated, well-lighted barns—all of which help keep cows healthy.*^{Ind. 23}

Beef Quality Assurance is better for cattle, better for ranchers, and better for people who appreciate beef's place in a healthy, sustainable diet.^{Ind. 2}

Animal Advocates

Regulars and Activists: Advocates on themselves

Some dissonance was observed in the way advocates referred to themselves. Advocates understand that the public will be more trusting of individuals with whom they can identify. They're simultaneously aware of the transformational quality of advocacy work to the advocates themselves. These factors seem to pull the language in opposite directions.

THL states, "You don't have to be passionate about protecting animals to recognize that these cruelties are unacceptable" while DxE describes its own members as "schoolteacher"^{Adv. 12, 18}, "UC Berkeley students"^{Adv. 20}, or local to the relevant area.^{Adv. 13} However, more often, advocates refer to their membership, supporters, or allies as "activists" or "vegans," placing them in a different category than the general public.

*DxE activists made it inside Farmer John where they attempted unsuccessfully to **rescue** a pig from slaughter. Days later, dozens of activists were arrested at the slaughterhouse for chaining themselves to the gate.*^{Adv. 12}

Johnson continued, "I'm proud to be born and raised in this state. Unfortunately, Iowa's rampant animal abuse and corrupt politics fly in the face of the common-decency values its good people instilled in me as a child."^{Adv. 13}

Sparse examples of the advocate as a **regular person** frame were found in the media.

"This world needs more empathy, we need to care about others a little bit more, and I do think most people care about animals," Soranno said before the sentencing. "I don't want to break the law, I don't want to be a mischief-



maker, I don't want to get in trouble. But I feel compelled to do it because if not, those animals just suffer. ^{Med. 15}

Renee King married a cattle rancher, turned vegan, and converted their ranch into a safe haven for farm animals....something she never thought would happen. ^{Med. 25}

Reporting on both of the criminal cases widely reported in October 2022 sometimes, but not always, unselfconsciously framed the activists as martyrs, quoting them emphasizing the injustice of the treatment of *regular people* who dared to challenge the industry.

Picklesimer is "probably the person that I know that enjoys being outdoors the most," he said, adding "it just breaks my heart to think of him and Wayne being locked up." ^{Med. 2}

"We take responsibility for what we did, while at the same time recognizing that without actions like this, animals in farms remain unseen and unheard with practically zero protections," Schafer said in an interview before the sentencing. ^{Med. 15}

Crazy Vegans: Industry on Advocates

The industry characterizes animal advocates as **extremists, dishonest, or corrupt**. These messages made their way into the media reports, though in this analysis they were only found as brief quotes in articles mostly focusing on advocate messages.

"The individuals who committed this act are part of an anti-meat movement determined to undermine livestock agriculture..." ^{Med. 2}

"...biased reporting, myths, half-truths and sometimes outright misinformation perpetuated by some environmental, food safety and animal rights groups concerning the aquaculture industry..." ^{Med. 28}

Animal Industry

Corporate Corruption: Advocates on Industry

All five advocate groups, especially DxE, MFA, and PETA, use language around corporate and government corruption and wrongdoing.



The cruel practices our investigative footage reveals stand in stark contrast to Costco's claim that animal welfare is a "critical component that has been integrated into all aspects of the chicken supply chain." - MFA^{Adv. 9}

While this language may sometimes promote little-picture thinking, pointing to individual instances of wrongdoing or specific problematic policies, it may also be a reportable story in and of itself. ^{Med 1, 48}

Advocates are aware of systemic factors, and on rare occasions explain these with the industry itself as the villain. However, these systemic portraits are **rarely accompanied by a credible systemic solution**. The resulting message conveys a deeply entrenched status quo that ordinary people could scarcely hope to change.

*The meat industry itself has utilized these cultural narratives to push its agenda of selling as much meat as possible to the public. The meat lobby is notoriously powerful, exerting influence on government agencies to tip the scales in its favor. This lobbying has been successful at **shaping federal dietary guidelines**, which recommend sustained meat intake while suppressing recommendations of meat consumption reductions. It's also kept meat prices **artificially low**, which has helped compel consumers to continue eating large portions of meat each day.^{Adv. 25} (Emphasis original)*

Luckily, we found more articulate systemic solutions in the media reports than in the advocate language, covering new proposed laws and regulations to protect animal welfare. ^{Med. 8, 10, 15, 19, 32, 33, 43}

Support Farmers: Industry on Itself

The industry characterizes farmers as regular people the reader can identify with. Farming is very important to their way of life and family legacy.

This is a romantic story easy to find repeated by the media.

According to the company's website, Niman Ranch was started in the early 1970s on a family-owned cattle ranch in Bolinas, California, just north of San Francisco. The company gained a reputation as one using humane methods and all-natural feeds, and before long, became a hit in local grocery stores and popular San Francisco Bay restaurants.^{Med. 21}

Industry materials paint farmers as heroic, trustworthy, committed, ethical, and expert. Their sacrifice of "waking up early every day" is one Americans should feel indebted to. Their hardworking nature deserves respect. They are the ones responsible for maintaining our **food**



supply with their specialized knowledge. Every piece of the system is meticulously designed with efficiency and ethics in mind.

When the media quotes farmers, they tell the same story.

Mike Boerboom, the third-generation farmer, hopes the justices will conclude that Californians have gone too far. "We produce a lot of food to feed the rest of the country," he said. "It's California today, but are there going to be more mandates that come potentially from every other state? That's the fear," he added.^{Med. 12}

"We raise pigs to feed people with wholesome, nutritious and affordable protein."^{Med. 2}

"The science of fish welfare is evolving and as new information emerges, many of the fish farming husbandry techniques practiced by modern aquaculture farms here in Asia is evolving concomitantly..."^{Med. 28}

Government

The media was quick to criticize the government in multiple countries, discussing poor regulation, and low enforcement of laws protecting animals and the environment, and excitedly relaying the story of a multi-state FBI investigation over the rescue of two dying piglets.

No instances of the industry responding to accusations of government corruption appeared in our reports. Instead, they pointed to government regulations to insist that their practices are held to high standards, or to cultural norms that using animals is acceptable and necessary. Discussion of regulation is the most common appeal to authority- if the industry is regulated, then how could anything bad be happening in it? These ideas weren't found in the media analysis.

Public Health

Preventing the next pandemic: Advocates on public health

As the advocate review was conducted in early 2021, advocates often invoked COVID-19 to criticize the industry for poor pandemic response and to emphasize the risk of animal agriculture towards creating "the next pandemic." This was detailed in a media piece titled "How Factory Farming Could Cause the Next COVID-19", which was published by The Regulatory Review, a University of Pennsylvania publication.^{Med. 31}



Antibiotic use in animal agriculture is often mentioned by advocates, though the risks it represents are not consistently articulated. Human health is sometimes mentioned as a great reason to go vegan or decrease consumption of animal products, and occasionally specific health risks are mentioned, such as increased heart disease and certain cancers associated with eating animals and animal products. These factors are generally a side note, and a transparent example of motivated reasoning. This may be familiar to members of the public exposed to industry framing of activists as dishonest about their true goals.

Using less: Industry on antibiotics

When disease or antibiotics are mentioned in industry messages, farmers are upheld as trusted experts to solve societal problems.

“The responsible use of antibiotics in animal agriculture is one of the most misunderstood topics in today’s food system,” said J.J. Jones, executive director of NIAA. “Farmers, ranchers and veterinarians face an ever-changing landscape of consumer demands without much needed constructive discussion or feedback.”^{Med. 42}

The media somewhat frequently discussed public health dangers as a result of factory farming, and in two long-form media pieces, journalists even explained the mechanism by which the overuse of antibiotics causes harm.^{Med. 22, 31} It seems that increased advocate messages around the disease risk of factory farming associated with the pandemic has been heard by the media.

Environment

A second-rate reason: Advocates on environment

Advocates mention climate change often and rarely describe any mechanism by which animal agriculture contributes to climate change, deforestation, ocean dead zones, or pollution. Environment, like public health, seems to function as secondary support for veganism.

Some long-form media reports explain mechanisms by which animal agriculture contributes to climate change, and less often, deforestation.

On the other hand, we know that livestock agriculture is a contributor to greenhouse gas emissions, responsible for 11.2% of U.S. emissions and 10-12% of global emissions, according to the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency and the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, respectively. These emissions arise



mainly from fertilizer application, manure management, and direct release from cattle. Further, land conversions for agriculture promote deforestation, a major contributor to climate change and biodiversity loss.^{Med. 40}

*In addition to the methane emitted from their digestive tract activity, cattle are also responsible for a high percentage of greenhouse gas produced from **manure management**. The latest 2020 gures have not matched the highest emissions on record: The two cattle categories have accounted for as much as 38.08 mil ion (dairy) and 11.14 million (beef) metric tons per year, while swine has accounted for up to 24.49 million metric tons per year. This is because during warmer months, bacteria **breaks manure down** into nutrients for the crops it fertilizes, a process that naturally produces greenhouse gasses as a byproduct.*^{Med. 58}

The process of producing meat is also terrible for the environment. Animal agriculture is responsible for a significant chunk of our greenhouse-gas emissions. We use more than a third of our planet’s habitable land to farm animals—land that may have been carbon-consuming forest or woodland. The destruction of forests for agriculture can leave many species, lots of them endangered, without a home. This can decimate biodiversity.^{Med. 22}

Treading lightly: Industry on the environment

In regards to the **environment**, the industry cites:

- what small percentage of the country’s total greenhouse gas emissions they create,
- meticulous environmental management processes,
- carbon sequestration,
- “upcycling” materials and land not fit for other uses (specifically in regards to cows),
- efficiency improvements over time,
- **regulations** that prohibit significant pollution, and
- use of **technology** that advances quickly to make the industry better in every way.

By and large, the media does not appear to be buying these arguments. Besides in brief retort quotes that don’t receive much engagement by the author, these messages weren’t found in media reports. It’s notable that the industry materials we chose did not differentiate between small farms and large farms, but were instead spokespeople and industry groups that sought to present a united front for the industry. It is possible our review missed materials portraying a successful media strategy pitting small farms against industrial facilities.

However, positive portrayals of animal agriculture’s effects on the environment were discussed in the media when advocating for particular practices that cause less harm.



Food production is one of the major drivers of the climate crisis, but new practices in agriculture offer important solutions. The bottom line is that the way that we move forward with producing food will have everything do with our success in addressing the climate crisis.^{Med. 40}

Consumers' Responsibility

Go Vegan: Advocates to consumers

The advocacy organizations we examined are both distinguished and unified by veganism. We know that the strong supporters and workers of each organization are overwhelmingly vegan-people who abstain from consuming animal products out of an ethical objection to the practice. But veganism plays significantly different roles in their respective messaging strategies.

DxE's asks of supporters are usually in the realm of calling elected officials or law enforcement, signing petitions, or participating in protests and other events, without any consumer ask or discussion of veganism. PETA makes veganism the ask of the majority of their press releases, while MFA requests instead that the audience choose more plant-based foods. They also promote their vegetarian starter guide, which advocates for only plant-based foods. THL also avoids veganism, and focuses consumer asks on meat consumption, such as by saying, *"Curbing or eliminating your meat consumption makes the world a better place."*^{Adv. 25}

Each of these organizations exists to advocate for animals. Veganism- discontinuing the personal consumption of animal products- exists to reduce demand for animal products and thus prevent animal suffering. However, much of the advocate materials are not about animals. Appeals to the environment, public health, or workers' well-being function to support veganism, which in turn is meant to protect animals. As discussed above in the section on antibiotics, this may play into the industry frame of advocates as dishonest about their true intentions.

Because 99% of our food comes from industrialized agriculture, many of the foods we eat contribute to these cruel industries. By choosing a diet free of animal products, known as a vegan or plant-based diet, we can help alleviate the amount of harm inflicted on workers and communities by animal farms and slaughterhouses. Check out our plant-based eating guide at the link below.^{Adv. 25}

Small Animal Replacement

There's a dark side to some of the arguments for reducing animal consumption- replacing large mammals, who cause worse harm to health and to the environment, with smaller animals,



means *more* animals suffering and slaughtered. Media articles sometimes specifically advocated replacing meat from large animals with meat from small animals.

Switching from eating beef to consuming poultry, for example, already result in fewer greenhouse gas emissions.^{Med. 60}

Likely due to regulations of US Checkoff programs, small animal replacement advocacy was not found in our industry analysis, and while advocates didn't outright advocate *for* small animal replacement in their environmental arguments, it may seem an unspoken suggestion to the reader. This presents a question for advocates who seek to rely on environmental and health arguments for their advocacy.

Be discerning: Industry to consumers

Industry materials, after discussing the positive environmental impacts of their work, often shift attention onto the consumer's responsibility with ways that a caring consumer might minimize their own impact without giving up animal products. This is the same frame used by the advocates, though the specific ask is different.

While we did find media acknowledgment of the harms caused by animal agriculture and the benefits of veganism (or meat reduction), we often found these alongside a consumer frame which limited discussion to what it was reasonable to ask of the reader.

When the media reports attributed responsibility to consumers, no particular pattern was noticed in what they suggested consumers do with that responsibility. Between different articles, we found suggestions that readers eat no meat, less meat, humanely raised meat, sustainably produced meat, and meat from smaller animals. As discussed above, we also saw in-depth reporting of systemic issues contributing to various problems associated with animals used for food.

What can you do? Typical Europeans and North Americans could cut back one-quarter of their annual average greenhouse gas emissions if they switch to plant-based foods.^{Med. 60}

Ultimately, Galvani said, "as consumers, the most important step we can take is to reduce or eliminate our consumption of animal products, fish included, if we want to protect our planet."^{Med. 28}

*Reducing the suffering of billions of factory-farmed animals is so hard in large part because overcoming human nature is so hard; most people, when **given the choice**, will choose cheap, conventional meat over the more expensive organic variety (or plant-based versions, for that matter).*^{Med. 57}



Dr. Mitloehner said that it was wrong to suggest that food choices would drastically affect the climate and the environment. (The Lancet researchers, and the scientific consensus, maintain that food choices do affect the climate.)^{Med. 55}

But could consuming large amounts of meat affect more than just your cholesterol levels?^{Med. 31}



Conclusion

Overall, the media is receptive to reporting advocate frames. They accept *environment* and *animal suffering* as reasons why policies that move society away from using animals for food should be pursued but don't always rely on advocating for the solutions that advocates most want. While comparing the effectiveness of advocates and industry messages is outside the scope of this report, the media seems willing to amplify the messages in use by the subject of their stories.

In the next report in this series, we examine how ordinary citizens understand the issues surrounding animals used for food in ways that do and don't overlap with the frames used by the media, advocates, and industry.

This process allowed us to identify sticky and effective frames from each voice in the ecosystem and to identify frames that backfire. It is no surprise that the consumer frame, in heavy use by the media, industry, and most advocate groups, was also heavily relied upon by ordinary Americans. In 1:1 interviews and focus groups we listened for frames used when the consumer frame was not present, and tested ways to overcome it.



References

Media

1. 11 charged with animal abuse at turkey farms. (2022, October 11). *Lancaster Farming*. https://www.lancasterfarming.com/farming-news/news/11-charged-with-animal-abuse-at-turkey-farms/article_16f8c0fe-4570-11ed-ae8-8751b2a801d3.html
2. Animal rights activists found not guilty on all charges after two piglets were taken from Circle Four Farms in Utah. (2022, October 9). *The Salt Lake Tribune*. <https://www.sltrib.com/news/2022/10/08/animal-rights-activists-charged/>
3. *Animal rights activists sentenced to time in jail for 2019 protest at B.C. hog farm*. (2022, October 13). CBC. <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/b-c-animal-rights-activists-get-jail-time-1.6614762>
4. Arnold, M. (2022, October 11). Why pork producers are challenging this animal cruelty law. *Yahoo News*. <https://www.yahoo.com/lifestyle/why-pork-producers-challenging-animal-160913962.html>
5. Bayly, J. (2022, October 27). Don't throw away your pumpkins after Halloween. It could be a farm animal's next snack. *WGME*. <https://wgme.com/news/local/dont-throw-away-your-pumpkins-after-halloween-it-could-be-a-farm-animals-next-snack>
6. Brinsford, J. (2022, October 5). Animal rights activists hit out at Bobby Wagner after "excessive" tackle. *Newsweek*. <https://www.newsweek.com/bobby-wagner-los-angeles-rams-animal-rights-tackle-excessive-1749053>
7. Chain, B. (2022, November 1). Animal rights protester who stood naked at Harrods speaks out against modern eco-zealots. *Daily Mail*. <https://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-11360879/Animal-rights-protester-stood-naked-Harrods-speaks-against-modern-eco-zealots.html>
8. Cover, S. (2022a, August 11). Citing a 'troubling vacuum in oversight' animal welfare groups call for new rules to govern fish farms. *Spectrum News Maine*. <https://spectrumlocalnews.com/me/maine/news/2022/08/11/groups-petition-state-for-new-aquaculture-rules>
9. Cover, S. (2022b, September 23). State rejects animal welfare petition to better regulate fish farms. *Spectrum News Maine*. <https://spectrumlocalnews.com/me/maine/news/2022/09/23/state-rejects-animal-welfare-group-s-fish-petition->



10. Dahm, J. (2022, November 2). Germany tightens animal transport rules, urges EU-wide follow-up. *Euractiv*. <https://www.euractiv.com/section/agriculture-food/news/germany-tightens-animal-transport-rules-urges-eu-wide-follow-up/>
11. DeMille, D. (2022, October 3). Animal rights groups protest as St. George trial set over pigs taken from Utah farm. *St. George Spectrum*. <https://eu.thespectrum.com/story/news/2022/10/03/dxe-animal-rights-groups-protest-st-george-trial-wayne-hsiung-paul-darwin-picklesimer-pigs-utah-farm/8167606001/>
12. Dwyer, D., Herndon, S., & Gehlen, B. (2022, October 11). Supreme Court battle over “cruelty” to pregnant pigs could affect pork prices, animal care. *ABC News*. <https://abcnews.go.com/Politics/supreme-court-case-weighs-treatment-pregnant-pigs-pork/story?id=89811909>
13. Edwards, R. (2022, October 18). Salmon firms accused of hiding lice levels. *The Ferret*. <https://thoferret.scot/salmon-firms-accused-lice-levels/>
14. Favre, D. (2022, October 4). Supreme court grapples with animal welfare in a challenge to a California law requiring pork to be humanely raised. *Yahoo News*. <https://news.yahoo.com/supreme-court-grapples-animal-welfare-122506229.html>
15. Fawcett-Atkinson, M. (2022, October 13). Animal rights activists jailed over sit-in protest at hog farm. *Canada’s National Observer*. <https://www.nationalobserver.com/2022/10/12/news/animal-rights-activists-jailed-over-sit-protest-hog-farm>
16. Fey, J. (2022, October 21). Delaware Valley University hosts stakeholder meeting, Discusses animal agriculture in Commonwealth. *BUCKSCO.Today*. <https://bucksco.today/2022/10/delaware-valley-university-stakeholder/>
17. Fortuna, C. (2022, November 1). Industrial agricultural needs to be replaced by agroecology — Soon. *CleanTechnica*. <https://cleantechnica.com/2022/10/31/industrial-agricultural-needs-to-be-replaced-by-agroecology-soon/>
18. Fur, L. (2022, October 11). Two animal rights activists await Wednesday sentencing. *Unicorn Riot*. <https://unicornriot.ninja/2022/two-animal-rights-activists-await-wednesday-sentencing/>
19. Galler, G. (2022, October 31). USDA urged to finalise ‘organic’ standards. *New Food Magazine*. <https://www.newfoodmagazine.com/news/169523/usda-urged-to-finalise-organic-standards/>



20. Gross, L. (2022, October 22). Shear power: Farm animals used to graze solar site. *Press Republican*. https://www.pressrepublican.com/news/shear-power-farm-animals-used-to-graze-solar-site/article_aa401206-4ab9-11ed-b9ec-6780b70c3660.html
21. Hallman, A. (2022, November 2). Sandquists named top hog farmers for Niman Ranch. *Southeast Iowa Union*. <https://www.southeastiowaunion.com/news/sandquists-named-top-hog-farmers-for-niman-ranch/>
22. Hamzelou, J. (2022, October 28). Will lab-grown meat reach our plates? *MIT Technology Review*. <https://www.technologyreview.com/2022/10/28/1062327/lab-grown-meat/>
23. Held, L. (2022, October 5). Next on the Supreme Court docket: Farm animal welfare. *Civil Eats*. <https://civileats.com/2022/10/05/supreme-court-docket-farm-animal-welfare-prop-12-california-gestation-crates-pork-industry/>
24. Highfield, A. (2022, October 16). Watch as animal rights protesters pour milk across floor at London’s Fortnum and Mason. *MyLondon*. <https://www.mylondon.news/news/zone-1-news/watch-animal-rights-protesters-pour-25271700>
25. Hoxworth, C. (2022, November 1). Degrees of science: Rowdy Girl Sanctuary with Renee King. *KWTX*. <https://www.kwtx.com/2022/11/01/degrees-science-rowdy-girl-sanctuary-with-renee-king/>
26. Inge, A. (2022, November 1). Christmas fundraiser to benefit Second Chance Farm set for Dec. 4. *Hood County News*. https://www.hcnews.com/news/christmas-fundraiser-to-benefit-second-chance-farm-set-for-dec-4/article_990cb032-59e8-11ed-9e49-1b3c7f2f1f2c.html
27. Jacobs, A. (2022, October 18). Animal rights activists are acquitted in Smithfield piglet case. *The New York Times*. <https://www.nytimes.com/2022/10/08/science/animals-rights-piglets-smithfield.html>
28. Jacobson, P. (2022, July 12). Fish-farming practices come under scrutiny amid surge in aquaculture. *Mongabay Environmental News*. <https://news.mongabay.com/2022/07/fish-farming-practices-come-under-scrutiny-amid-surge-in-aquaculture/>
29. Kateman, B. (2022, October 18). AI could fuel factory farming—or end it. *Fast Company*. <https://www.fastcompany.com/90796707/ai-could-fuel-factory-farming-or-end-it>
30. Kessler, M. (2022, October 4). ‘Elevate the message’: Animal rights activists protest in St. George ahead of Circle Four Farm trial. *Stgnews*. <https://www.stgeorgeutah.com/news/archive/2022/10/04/mgk-elevate-the-message-animal-rights-activists-protest-in-st-george-ahead-of-circle-four-farm-trial/>



31. Khodor, O. (2022, October 12). How factory farming could cause the next COVID-19. *The Regulatory Review*. <https://www.theregreview.org/2022/10/12/khodor-how-factory-farming-could-cause-the-next-covid-19/>
32. Kopecky, A. (2022, October 12). Animal rights activists are escalating tactics to expose 'systemic abuse' in factory farms. Has it backfired? *Canada's National Observer*. <https://www.nationalobserver.com/2022/10/11/news/animal-rights-activists-escalating-tactics-expose-systemic-abuse-factory-farms>
33. Krupnick, M. (2022, October 19). EPA sued over lack of plan to regulate water pollution from factory farms. *The Guardian*. <https://www.theguardian.com/environment/2022/oct/19/epa-lawsuit-water-pollution-factory-farms>
34. Libauskas, R. (2022, October 10). Home sweet habitat: How animal agriculture destroys our planet. *Pittsburgh Post-Gazette*. <https://www.post-gazette.com/opinion/Op-Ed/2022/10/03/peta-world-habitat-day-climate-change-vegan-yellowstone-amazon-rebecca-libauskas/stories/202210030002>
35. Loader, J. (2022, November 1). Nude militant vegans pose as bloodied "human flesh" in middle of busy London. *Daily Star*. <https://www.dailystar.co.uk/news/latest-news/nude-militant-vegans-pose-bloodied-28381706>
36. Makayla Coffee. (2022, October 28). Animals get a second chance at life at Manchester sanctuary. *MLive*. <https://www.mlive.com/news/ann-arbor/2022/10/animals-get-a-second-chance-at-life-at-manchester-sanctuary.html>
37. McGuckin, I. (2022, October 28). Bath Morrisons: Open Cages activists stage protest at new store. *SomersetLive*. <https://www.somersetlive.co.uk/news/local-news/bath-morrisons-open-cages-activists-7757592>
38. McKeith, S. (2022, October 21). Virtual fences a farming 'game-changer' *The Canberra Times*. <https://www.canberratimes.com.au/story/7951861/virtual-fences-a-farming-game-changer/>
39. McNeill, Z. (2022, October 5). Animal rights whistleblowers stand trial as supporters rally outside Utah courthouse. *Waging Nonviolence*. <https://wagingnonviolence.org/2022/10/animal-rights-direct-action-everywhere-whistleblowers-trial-utah/>
40. Meeting a 'generational challenge': Feeding the world and doing it sustainably. (2022, October 13). *Penn Today*. <https://penntoday.upenn.edu/news/penn-vet-medicine-meeting-generational-challenge-feeding-world-and-doing-it-sustainably>



41. Namkung, V. (2022, October 24). 'Fishless fish': the next big trend in the seafood industry. *The Guardian*.
<https://www.theguardian.com/environment/2022/oct/22/lab-grown-fish-cell-seafood-bluenalu-wildtype>
42. National Institute for Animal Agriculture partners with CDC. (2022, October). *Drovers News Source*. <https://www.drovers.com/news/industry/national-institute-animal-agriculture-partners-cdc>
43. Neslen, A. (2022, October 27). EU on track to break pledge to cut methane emissions by 30%, warns report. *The Guardian*.
<https://www.theguardian.com/environment/2022/oct/26/eu-on-track-to-break-pledge-to-cut-methane-emissions-by-30-warns-report>
44. New Zealand angers its farmers by proposing taxing cow burps. (2022, October 11). *NPR*. <https://www.npr.org/2022/10/11/1127955580/new-zealand-angers-its-farmers-by-proposing-taxing-cow-burps>
45. *PETA protests outside Wegmans in Rochester*. (2022, October 18). [Video]. WHAM.
<https://13wham.com/news/local/animal-rights-protests-outside-wegmans-in-rochester>
46. Pomrenke, E. (2022, October 31). Further animal abuse from Borgarförður farmer already implicated earlier this year. *Iceland Review*.
<https://www.icelandreview.com/news/animal-abuse-borgarfjordur/>
47. Quinn, A. (2022, October 7). Animal rights protesters pour milk into luxury department stores. *The Independent*. <https://www.independent.co.uk/climate-change/selfridges-fortnum-mason-animal-rights-protest-b2197939.html>
48. Rose, C. (2022, October 6). American Humane rescues horses, other farm animals affected by Hurricane Ian. *Palm Beach Daily News*.
<https://eu.palmbeachdailynews.com/story/news/2022/10/05/hurricane-ian-american-humane-rescues-horses-other-farm-animals/8170003001/>
49. RTÉ News. (2022, October 27). Judge describes Galway animal welfare offences as "shocking." *RTE*. <https://www.rte.ie/news/regional/2022/10/27/1331815-calves-cruelty/>
50. *Sedona farm animals helping people heal*. (2022, October 24). [Video]. Kyma.
<https://kyma.com/news/top-stories/2022/10/24/sedona-farm-animals-helping-people-heal/>
51. Shell, E. R. (2022, May 1). Innovative fish farms aim to feed the planet, Save jobs and clean up an industry's dirty reputation. *Scientific American*.



- <https://www.scientificamerican.com/article/innovative-fish-farms-aim-to-feed-the-planet-save-jobs-and-clean-up-an-industrys-dirty-reputation/>
52. Sheridan, K. (2022, October 5). “I’ve never lost this many animals.” Inside a dairy farm hit by Hurricane Ian. *WUSF*. <https://wusfnews.wusf.usf.edu/weather/2022-10-05/never-lost-this-many-animals-inside-dairy-farm-hurricane-ian>
53. Sliman, K. (2022, November 1). “Growing Impact” podcast probes world of cellular agriculture, meat production. *Penn State University*. Retrieved November 4, 2022, from <https://www.psu.edu/news/institutes-energy-and-environment/story/growing-impact-podcast-probes-world-cellular-agriculture>
54. Stancil, K. (2022, October 11). Acquittal of activists who saved dying piglets from Smithfield sets 'Right to rescue' precedent. *Common Dreams*. <https://www.commondreams.org/news/2022/10/09/acquittal-activists-who-saved-dying-piglets-smithfield-sets-right-rescue-precedent>
55. Tabuchi, H. (2022, November 1). He’s an outspoken defender of meat. Industry funds his research, Files show. *The New York Times*. <https://www.nytimes.com/2022/10/31/climate/frank-mitloehner-uc-davis.html>
56. Torrella, K. (2022a, October 20). The future perfect 50: Carolina Galvani, animal welfare activist at Sinergia Animal. *Vox*. <https://www.vox.com/future-perfect/23344716/future-perfect-50-carolina-galvani-animal-welfare-activist-sinergia-animal>
57. Torrella, K. (2022b, October 25). What is an animal’s life worth? *Vox*. <https://www.vox.com/future-perfect/2022/10/25/23412945/farm-animal-welfare-humane-meat-eggs-vote>
58. Vale, A. (2022, October 11). Visualizing three decades of animal agriculture emissions in the US. *Northwest Georgia News*. https://www.northwestgeorgianews.com/visualizing-three-decades-of-animal-agriculture-emissions-in-the-us/collection_932f7546-53ed-52c7-8891-d79b3c577434.html#1
59. Vidal, J. (2022, October 6). Bird flu ‘an urgent warning to move away from factory farming.’ *The Guardian*. <https://www.theguardian.com/environment/2022/oct/06/bird-flu-an-urgent-warning-to-move-away-from-factory-farming>
60. Wilde, W. (2022, October 30). Fact check: How bad is eating meat for the climate? *DW*. <https://www.dw.com/en/fact-check-is-eating-meat-bad-for-the-environment/a-63595148>



61. Williams, D. (2022, October 31). 40 years ago, protesters were celebrated for saving the Franklin River. Today they could be jailed for months. *The Conversation*.
<https://theconversation.com/40-years-ago-protesters-were-celebrated-for-saving-the-franklin-river-today-they-could-be-jailed-for-months-191579>
62. Williams, R. (2022, October 28). The Download: the human toll of ethical AI, and lab-grown meat. *MIT Technology Review*.
<https://www.technologyreview.com/2022/10/28/1062344/download-human-toll-ethical-ai-lab-grown-meat/>

Opposition

1. *American Egg Board*. (2020, July 30). <https://www.incredibleegg.org/>
2. *Beef sustainability and chefs*. (n.d.). Beef: It's what's for dinner. Retrieved April 30, 2021, from <https://www.beefitswhatsfordinner.com/raising-beef/beef-sustainability-and-chefs>
3. Budd, T. (2021, March 2). Column: It's important to stand up for farmers in D.C. *The Courier-Tribune*. <https://eu.courier-tribune.com/story/opinion/2021/03/02/broiler-breeders-and-coronavirus-food-assistance-program/6871865002/>
4. *Check in on all things chicken*. (n.d.). Chicken Check In. Retrieved April 19, 2021, from <https://www.chickencheck.in/>
5. Dairy farmers are being tested during these difficult times | Opinion. (2020, June 8). *Pennlive*. <https://www.pennlive.com/opinion/2020/06/dairy-farmers-are-being-tested-during-these-difficult-times-opinion.html>
6. *Discover the versatility of*. (n.d.). American Lamb. Retrieved April 23, 2021, from <https://www.americanlamb.com/>
7. Fortenberry, R. J. (2021, April 6). Local View: A beef with Bill Gates. *Journal Star* https://journalstar.com/opinion/columnists/local-view-a-beef-with-bill-gates/article_1912f587-47ed-5cc6-b7ce-1fb928f422b9.html
8. Friednash, D. (2021, April 13). Friednash: The Colorado animal cruelty initiative is actually a campaign to end meat, poultry and dairy production. *The Denver Post*. <https://www.denverpost.com/2021/04/08/animal-cruelty-initiative-13-pause-colorado/>
9. Ganzert, R. (2021, March 25). Guest opinion: The future of 'green agriculture' is here. *Deseret News*. <https://www.deseret.com/opinion/2021/3/25/22350912/green-agriculture-farming-climate-change-emissions-american-humane>



10. Letter: Getting rid of hog farms is real goal of anti-biogas activists. (2021, January 25). *The Fayetteville Observer*.
<https://eu.fayobserver.com/story/opinion/letters/2021/01/25/getting-rid-hog-farms-real-goal-anti-biogas-activists/6698400002/>
11. *Meating Place*. (n.d.). Retrieved April 23, 2021, from <https://www.meatingplace.com/>
12. Naerbout, R. (2021, April 21). Opinion: Farm Workforce Modernization Act protects workers and agriculture industry. *Post Register*.
https://www.postregister.com/opinion/guest_column/opinion-farm-workforce-modernization-act-protects-workers-and-agriculture-industry/article_04c09974-d58a-50fa-8f31-1c9d33bdd58c.html
13. National Milk Producers Federation publishes survey findings. (2019, January 23). *Deli Market News*. <https://www.delimarketnews.com/press-release/national-milk-producers-federation-publishes-survey-findings>
14. NCC responds to New York Times opinion piece about broiler welfare. (2021, February 12). *Washington Report*. <https://nccwashingtonreport.com/2021/02/12/ncc-responds-to-new-york-times-opinion-piece-about-broiler-welfare/>
15. Opinion: Veganuary campaign not telling the whole story of animal agriculture. (2021, February 3). *Eat North*. <https://eatnorth.com/jenn-sharp/opinion-veganuary-campaign-not-telling-whole-story-animal-agriculture>
16. P, L. (2013, July 13). Animal use is not animal abuse. *Star Tribune*.
https://trib.com/opinion/columns/animal-use-is-not-animal-abuse/article_e125208b-7083-59f8-8aba-4e53c5e6e3e2.html
17. *Real pork makes a real difference - National Pork Board*. (n.d.). Pork.org. Retrieved April 23, 2021, from <https://pork.org/>
18. Roth, H. (2020, December 16). Animal rights activist group's ideas are nuts and ignore the heroism of meat industry workers. *Des Moines Register*.
<https://eu.desmoinesregister.com/story/opinion/readers/2020/12/13/letter-meat-pork-producers-animal-rights-group-pcrm-ideas-nuts/6529043002/>
19. Senate, E. J. U. S. (2021, June 2). Joni Ernst: I'll stand up for Iowa in war against meat. *Globe Gazette*. https://globegazette.com/opinion/columnists/joni-ernst-ill-stand-up-for-iowa-in-war-against-meat/article_a12a03f7-0ce7-56bd-a0d9-956389604539.html
20. Taubes, G. (2021, January 29). The keto way: What if meat is our healthiest diet? *WSJ*.
<https://www.wsj.com/articles/the-keto-way-what-if-meat-is-our-healthiest-diet-11611935911>



21. *The Farm Babe* | Michelle Miller. (n.d.). The Farm Babe. Retrieved April 23, 2021, from <https://thefarmbabe.com/>
22. Thomas, C. (2021, February 17). 'Climate expert' Bill Gates' synthetic beef folly. *The Washington Times*. <https://www.washingtontimes.com/news/2021/feb/17/climate-expert-bill-gates-synthetic-beef-folly/>
23. Undeniably Dairy. (n.d.). *Join us on the journey*. US Dairy. Retrieved April 30, 2021, from <https://www.usdairy.com/>

Advocates

1. *Arby's, Lucky's, Pita Pit report cage-free progress*. (2021, January 14). <https://thehumaneleague.org/article/arbys-cage-free>
2. Aspey, J. (2017, September 22). *Cutest kid answers why he doesn't eat animals* [Video]. YouTube. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KspFD7z4ITs>
3. Bugga, H. (2021a, February 11). *A House Panel Is Investigating the Meat Industry's Response to COVID-19*. Mercy for Animals. <https://mercyforanimals.org/blog/investigating-meat-industry/>
4. Bugga, H. (2021b, February 18). *Drivers Stunned as Escaped Cows Raced Down a Highway in Indiana*. Mercy for Animals. <https://mercyforanimals.org/blog/escaped-cows-highway/>
5. Bugga, H. (2021c, February 23). *Four Clever Pigs Master a Video Game in New Study*. Mercy for Animals. <https://mercyforanimals.org/blog/pigs-video-game/>
6. Bugga, H. (2021d, March 5). *Beyond Meat Teams Up with McDonald's, KFC, Pizza Hut, and More*. Mercy for Animals. <https://mercyforanimals.org/blog/beyond-meat-mcdonalds/>
7. Bugga, H. (2021e, March 12). *Cuttlefish Demonstrate Intelligence, Pass Test for Human Children*. Mercy for Animals. <https://mercyforanimals.org/blog/cuttlefish-intelligence/>
8. Bugga, H. (2021f, April 5). *Introducing The Mission, a New Behind-the-Scenes Video Series*. Mercy for Animals. <https://mercyforanimals.org/blog/behind-the-scenes-video-series/>
9. Bugga, H. (2021g, April 12). *Mercy For Animals Took to the Streets to Expose Costco's Cruelty*. Mercy for Animals. <https://mercyforanimals.org/blog/costcos-cruelty/>
10. *Burger King UK commits to ending the most extreme abuses of chickens*. (2021, April 8). <https://thehumaneleague.org/article/burger-king-uk-commits-to-better-chicken-commitment>



11. Direct Action Everywhere. (2021a, January 29). *Case dismissed against Iowa man who exposed cruel mass pig killing at major pork supplier* [Press release].
12. Direct Action Everywhere. (2021b, February 15). *Activists delivered 7,000 paper hearts to Farmer John Slaughterhouse for the 7,000 pigs killed each day* [Press release].
13. Direct Action Everywhere. (2021c, February 17). *FBI attempts to infiltrate animal rights group following cruel mass pig killing exposé* [Press release].
14. Direct Action Everywhere. (2021d, March 4). *Chained activists occupy California horse racing track, stopping Thursday's races* [Press release].
15. Direct Action Everywhere. (2021e, March 6). *Activists in Coalinga with 50-foot banner and giant Gavin Newsom head protest Harris Ranch* [Press release].
16. Direct Action Everywhere. (2021f, March 22). *"Ag-Gag" prosecution targets Iowa man who recorded gruesome pig killings* [Press release].
17. Direct Action Everywhere. (2021g, March 25). *24-Hour demonstration underway at Gavin Newsom's house, featuring giant Newsom head* [Press release].
18. Direct Action Everywhere. (2021h, March 31). *Woman accepts Scotland County plea offer after removing sick piglet from Smithfield factory farm* [Press release].
19. Direct Action Everywhere. (2021i, April 7). *Land O' Lakes Dairy exposé reveals freezing calves, widespread violations of company policy and the law* [Press release].
20. Direct Action Everywhere. (2021j, April 12). *Three UC Berkeley students still locked down inside dining facility lockdown, Arrests expected* [Press release].
21. Earthling Ed. (2018, April 14). *You will never look at your life in the same way again | Eye-opening speech!* [Video]. YouTube.
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Z3u7hXpOm58>
22. Farm Sanctuary, Inc. (n.d.). *What is Factory Farming?* Farm Sanctuary. Retrieved April 19, 2021, from <https://www.farmsanctuary.org/issue/factory-farming/>
23. *Five animals who escaped from slaughter against all odds.* (2021, March 19).
<https://thehumaneleague.org/article/escaped-farm-animals>
24. *Is it time to rethink your Costco connection?* (2021, April 21). The Humane League.
<https://thehumaneleague.org/article/rethink-your-costco-connection>
25. *Is meat consumption in the US increasing or declining?* (2021, March 21). The Humane League. <https://thehumaneleague.org/article/meat-consumption-in-the-us>
26. People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals. (2021a, January 28). *Nellie's free range eggs earns PETA 'Pants on fire' award* [Press release].



<https://www.peta.org/media/news-releases/nellies-free-range-eggs-earns-peta-pants-on-fire-award/>

27. People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals. (2021b, February 3). *Update: 'Chicken' to give away vegan wings beside PETA billboard* [Press release].

<https://www.peta.org/media/news-releases/update-chicken-to-give-away-vegan-wings-beside-peta-billboard/>

28. People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals. (2021c, February 21). *Sanderson Farms shareholder PETA suggests vegan focus* [Press release].

<https://www.peta.org/media/news-releases/sanderson-farms-shareholder-peta-suggests-vegan-focus/>

29. People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals. (2021d, February 23). *Cow repeatedly shot in the head; PETA seeks criminal probe* [Press release].

<https://www.peta.org/media/news-releases/cow-repeatedly-shot-in-the-head-peta-seeks-criminal-probe-3/>

30. People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals. (2021e, March 8). *PETA calls out Fish-Killing 'plant-based' company* [Press release].

<https://www.peta.org/media/news-releases/peta-calls-out-fish-killing-plant-based-company/>

31. People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals. (2021f, March 12). *Virginia Tech criticized over 'pardoned' turkeys in new PETA ad* [Press release].

<https://www.peta.org/media/news-releases/virginia-tech-criticized-over-pardoned-turkeys-in-new-peta-ad/>

32. People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals. (2021g, March 31). *PETA to give away vegan ham in 'Thou shalt not kill' appeal* [Press release].

<https://www.peta.org/media/news-releases/peta-to-give-away-vegan-ham-in-thou-shalt-not-kill-appeal/>

33. People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals. (2021h, March 31). *Surprise! PETA's chicken billboard rises near meaty eateries* [Press release].

<https://www.peta.org/media/news-releases/surprise-petas-chicken-billboard-rises-near-meaty-eateries/>

34. People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals. (2021i, April). *Bull Repeatedly Shot, Conscious Pig Left to Bleed Out—PETA Seeks Criminal Probe* [Press release].

<https://www.peta.org/media/news-releases/bull-repeatedly-shot-conscious-pig-left-to-bleed-out-peta-seeks-criminal-probe/>

35. People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals. (2021j, April 9). *PETA to support neighborhood slaughterhouse permit—on one condition* [Press release].



<https://www.peta.org/media/news-releases/peta-to-support-neighborhood-slaughterhouse-permit-on-one-condition/>

36. *Thousands of animals suffer in ships along the blocked Suez Canal*. (2021, April 5). Mercy for Animals. <https://mercyforanimals.org/blog/animals-blocked-suez-canal/>
37. von Turkovich, M. (2021, March 25). *Getting to know this special chicken changed my perspective*. The Humane League. <https://thehumaneleague.org/article/getting-to-know-chickens>
38. *Whole Foods Market to phase out live-shackle slaughter*. (2020, December 16). The Humane League. <https://thehumaneleague.org/article/wholefoods-market-to-end-live-shackle-slaughter>
39. Windsor, M. (2020, December 11). *A cage-free future is coming*. The Humane League. <https://thehumaneleague.org/article/cage-free-future-is-coming>
40. Windsor, M. (2021a, February 18). *Supermarkets need to address meat chicken welfare in 2021*. <https://thehumaneleague.org/article/supermarkets-chicken-welfare>
41. Windsor, M. (2021b, February 25). *No, Costco, there's nothing "normal" about animal cruelty*. The Humane League. <https://thehumaneleague.org/article/costco-animal-cruelty>